

Historic Preservation Commission
Minutes of November 19, 2018

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Michael Erquiaga
Shanda K. Horner
Emmett Lifsey
Richard Morris
Shaun Spencer-Hester

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Mark Little, Vice-Chair
Christopher McSwain, Chair

OTHERS PRESENT:

Ms. Anne Nygaard, Secretary to the Historic Preservation Commission; Ms. Robin Craig, Planning Technician, and the public.

ROLL CALL:

After a quorum was established, Commissioner Morris called the meeting to order at 3:45 p.m.

1.a. CONSENT AGENDA:

Commissioner Horner made a motion, which was seconded by Commissioner Erquiaga, to accept the consent agenda.

2. Old Business:

(a) ACTION: (Advocate-Commissioner Horner): Previously tabled request of Sandra Mitchell to install a lofted barn style utility shed at the rear of the property at 813 Federal Street. A revised style selection has been submitted since the last meeting for a Dura Temp, Dutch Lap End Utility Low Wall Barn.

Ms. Sandra Mitchell was present to represent the application. Ms. Nygaard showed the commissioners a photo of the proposed shed. Ms. Nygaard explained it will have no windows and showed them where the door would be located. It will have horizontal siding. Ms. Nygaard also showed the commissioners the paint colors Ms. Mitchell has selected for the roof, siding and trim. Commissioner Horner made a motion to approve the application as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Lifsey and passed by the following vote:

AYES:	Erquiaga, Horner, Lifsey, Morris and Spencer-Hester	5
NOES:		0
ABSTENTIONS:		0
ABSENT:	Little and McSwain	2

(b) ACTION: (Advocate-Commissioner McSwain): Request of Mauricio Becerra to enclose the lower porch on the rear of the home at 2904 Rivermont Avenue. At the

last meeting, the commission approved the “rebuilding of porches with the upper porch enclosed, to match neighbor at 2900 Rivermont Avenue. Required details include faux columns to mimic current columns and hardiplank with wood grain siding. Windows may be 6 over 6, 1 over 1, or casements.” An additional submittal was required for enclosing of the lower porch with scaled drawings and window details. Submitted rendering is vague and additional was requested pertaining to materials, transition to the right of enclosed area and paint colors.

Mr. Mauricio Becerra was present to represent the application. He had a rendering that he had done himself to demonstrate how the house would look with both porches enclosed. Commissioner Spencer-Hester asked if the addition to the right of the porches is there now. Mr. Becerra said it is. He made the siding color a different color in the rendering just to show a contrast. They have not decided on a color for the siding. The trim color on the addition as well as the porches will match. Mr. Becerra explained that where the railing is missing on the addition is where a bump out is located. Commissioner Lifsey asked about color choices. Mr. Becerra said they have not decided on the exact colors but are thinking a blue for the addition and grey for the shingled body of the house.

Commissioner Spencer-Hester asked if he would be recreating any of the wooden elements of the current porches. Mr. Becerra said he would like to recreate the columns that are on the addition on the enclosed porches. He will also salvage the railings and use them in other places on the back of the house (the lower level that has brick piers). Commissioner Morris commented that there seems to be a disconnect between the addition and the proposed porches. To him, nothing seems to be tying them together. It might be because of the “cut and paste” that was done to make this rendering. He is not able to see the detail of the cornice and soffit on the photoshopped rendering. Commissioner Morris pointed out that on the house next door, which is a sister house to Mr. Becerra’s, everything flows nicely. Mr. Becerra said he would be continuing the cornice and soffit from the addition to the two enclosed porches.

Commissioner Morris thought that Mr. Becerra would have to do a more detailed drawing for his building permit. He thought an elevation and a wall section would need to be submitted for his permit as well. Mr. Becerra said he wanted to get the commission’s full approval for everything he plans to do before having the contractor submit for a building permit. Commissioner Lifsey asked if the paint colors will be approved administratively. Ms. Nygaard said if the choices meet the guidelines, she will approve them administratively. If there is a question in her mind, she will bring the selections to the commission for its approval.

There was discussion about the bump out. Mr. Becerra explained it sits back about a foot from the face of the skirt board. He does not plan on removing it but it will be repainted. Commissioner Spencer-Hester asked if the porch ceilings will be wood sheathing. He said he might want to do tongue and groove maybe stained. The front porches are a pale blue. He could do the same on the rear porches.

There were questions about the windows. Mr. Becerra said they would be wood windows, aluminum clad. He said he wanted to know what style they would approve before he shopped for them. Currently, a lot of the windows on the house are nine over nine. Commissioner Morris would suggest no lights so that these windows look different than those on the main house. Ms. Nygaard reminded them that at their last meeting, they had approved either six

over six, one over one or casement windows. The commission recommended one over one and Mr. Becerra indicated he would prefer one over one. Commissioner Spencer-Hester asked if he planned on any exterior doors on either of the porches. He said he did not; the access to them would be from the interior.

Commissioner Lifsey made a motion to approve the application as presented noting that all trim color should match existing trim and be in continuation thereof, that windows will be one over one, aluminum clad wood. Ms. Nygaard asked for clarification that the columns will be wood and Mr. Becerra said that was correct. She asked for clarification that the railing on the addition will be continuous and not missing where the bump out is located. Mr. Becerra said that was correct. Commissioner Lifsey added to his motion that the columns will match in kind and that paint colors will be reviewed at a future submission.

Commissioner Morris asked if they should request more detailed drawings because they will be required by the Inspections Division. Commissioner Lifsey said the Inspections Division will request what they need from Mr. Becerra. Commissioner Morris noted that they do not even know the window sizes. Ms. Nygaard noted that they had previously said that they need to match the windows at 2900 Rivermont Avenue. Ms. Craig commented that the plans reviewer does not require a certain level of expertise for a drawing. A person can come with a hand drawn, not to scale one and it will be accepted. What Mr. Becerra has done with the photoshopped rendering submitted for the commissioner would likely be acceptable to the plans reviewer.

Commissioner Morris asked for clarification as to what was approved last month. Ms. Nygaard indicated he was approved to enclose the upper porch to match the neighbor's porch at 2900 Rivermont Avenue. Required details include faux columns to mimic current columns and hardiplank with wood grain siding. Windows may be six over six, one over one or casements. Commissioner Lifsey added to his motion that the windows should be similar in size to those on the adjacent property's porch. Ms. Nygaard asked if they would be modifying their COA approval from last month to indicate the windows should be one over one on the upper porch. Commissioner Lifsey indicated that in discussion it sounds like the applicant wants to do one over one on both porches. Commissioner Horner seconded the motion and it passed by the following vote:

AYES:	Erquiaga, Horner, Lifsey, Morris and Spencer-Hester	5
NOES:		0
ABSTENTIONS:		0
ABSENT:	Little and McSwain	2

3. New Business:

(a) ACTION (Advocate-Commissioner Lifsey): Request of Robert Bruce Johnson to replace two wooden columns with polymarble replacements fabricated to match the originals at 517 Washington Street.

Mr. Bruce Johnson was present to represent the application. Mr. Johnson said the columns are both fluted and tapered. They had to find companies to custom make them to match. They looked at wood columns versus a more durable and contemporary material, which is

polymarble. He mentioned that there are other houses on Washington Street that have been approved for synthetic materials. This product comes with a lifetime guarantee. Commissioner Morris asked for clarification that the columns will match. Mr. Johnson said they will be a perfect match. Mr. Johnson also noted that the columns are not really visible from the street because of a Japanese Ewe that obscures them from view expect from a side angle. Commissioner Lifsey made a motion to accept the application as presented. It was seconded by Commissioner Horner and passed by the following vote:

AYES:	Erquiaga, Horner, Lifsey, Morris and Spencer-Hester	5
NOES:		0
ABSTENTIONS:		0
ABSENT:	Little and McSwain	2

(c) ACTION (Advocate-Commissioner Morris): Request of Victoria’s Inventory, LLC to 1) replace the roofs, 2) repair and/or replace wood trim/details, 3) repoint brick masonry, 4) repair windows/doors, 5) rebuild existing balconies, and 6) add balconies to the building at 301 Rivermont Avenue:

Mr. Casey Servis with Architectural Design was present to represent the application. The main item that will probably need discussion is the removal of the existing balconies, which are in very poor condition, and the adding of some additional balconies. Some of the windows would need to be converted to balcony doors. The doors would probably be aluminum clad but will match the existing windows. They will match the existing windows in color, size and profile.

Commissioner Morris asked about the profile of the railing. Mr. Servis showed them when they were on a side elevation. They will be simple metal pickets. There is a mix of wood and metal there and none of it is original. r being painted, one would not be able to tell the difference between it and wood. The posts will be six by six pressure treated wood.

Commissioner Morris asked if they were going to use the correct mortar. Mr. Servis said they will be doing so. Commissioner Morris noted that the areas that will be replaced with membrane cannot be seen. Mr. Servis noted that instead of asphalt shingles, they are proposing fiber cement.

Commissioner Spencer-Hester wanted to know if there was any evidence as to how the balconies were supported. She wondered if there were brackets and not posts. There are some historical photos of the building available and Mr. Servis indicated that it looks like the balconies had posts in those photos. But he acknowledged that it is also hard to tell from the photos and the balconies could have been supported with brackets.

Commissioner Morris noted that he did not see any issue with the proposed materials. The balconies will look newer than the original building. He thinks they need to discuss whether or not they are okay with the new door openings and the addition of balconies because they will change the façade of the building. Commissioner Morris thinks that the front façade is what you really see with this building. He goes by this building every day and it is really difficult to see anything on the sides of the building, especially in the summer. Even though there will be a change to the façade, the railings are very translucent. He thinks they balconies will kind of just disappear. Commissioner Morris is concerned that there may be a lot of furniture and junk

